

DISAGREEMENT HIERARCHY

REFUTING THE CENTRAL POINT

DH5

The central point is shown not to be supported through the evidence offered

- Requires thoughtful and critical attention to the details of your opponent's position.
- Here you have moved well beyond competing conclusions and have examined the inference between a core tenet and the conclusion offered

▶▶ The most powerful form and level within the DH; DH4 + DH5 are critical, convincing, and cogent

REFUTATION

DH4

The conclusion is shown not to follow from the argument as offered

- The focus is squarely on evidence and premises
- Is there sufficient support and inference between the evidence and the conclusion?

▶▶ The most convincing form and level within the DH; DH4 + DH5 are very rare in the wild

COUNTERARGUMENT

DH3

A contradiction with evidence is offered for consideration

- Here the original position is contrasted with an example that can refute the point of the original argument
- Requires that all participants focus on the same issue

▶▶ Has the potential to be engaging but only if focus is consistent and critical

CONTRADICTION

DH2

An opposing position is offered but with very little evidence

- The person disagreeing does offer a counter- position
- The conclusion is the starting point and not the resting point!

▶▶ Although an improvement, DH2 remains non-critical and combative

AD HOMINEM

DH1

Attacks the person rather than the point

- literal translation "against the person"
- can focus on the person, situation, or even the cultural context

▶▶ A non-effective and non-critical level of the DH

NAME-CALLING

DH0

Engage through name-calling

- literal translation "against the person"
- attempts to devalue what is being advanced without considering what is being advanced

▶▶ Lowest + least constructive of the DH



SOURCE

Ratner, P. (March 19, 2018). "How to disagree well: 7 of the best and worst ways to argue." *Big Think*. Retrieved from <https://bigthink.com/personal-growth/how-to-disagree-well-7-of-the-best-and-worst-ways-to-argue/>



**LAS 1110
ETHICS & CAPITALISM
NEC
SUMMER 2022**